

1 G. WHITNEY LEIGH (SBN 153457)
2 GONZALEZ & LEIGH LLP
3 744 Montgomery Street, Fifth Floor
San Francisco, CA 94111
4 Telephone: (415) 912-5950
Facsimile: (415) 912-5951
5 Attorneys for Plaintiff
DENIZ BOLBOL
6 JOSEPH P. CUVIELLO
P.O. Box 2834
7 Redwood City, CA 94064
Telephone: (650) 654-9955
Plaintiff In Pro Se
8 STEPHEN M. MACPHAIL, Bar No. 106522
9 BRAGG & KULUVA
555 S. Flower Street, Suite 600
10 Los Angeles, California 90071
Telephone: (213) 612-5335
11 Facsimile: (213) 612-5712
Attorneys for Defendants,
12 SMG, COUNTY OF ALAMEDA,
RON LITTLE, LEROY "SKEET" ELLIS,
13 OAKLAND-ALAMEDA COUNTY COLISEUM AUTHORITY
OAKLAND COLISEUM JOINT VENTURE
14 RICHARD M. WILLIAMS
Gray •Duffy, LLP
702 Marshall Street, Suite 600
16 Redwood City, CA 94063
Telephone: Office: (650) 365-7343
17 Attorneys for Defendants CITY OF OAKLAND
OAKLAND POLICE OFFICER R. VALLADON,
18 OAKLAND POLICE OFFICER R. VILLEGAS

19
20 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
21 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
22 SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

23 JOSEPH P. CUVIELLO AND
DENIZ BOLBOL, INDIVIDUALLY,

Case Nos. 06-cv-05517-EMC
and 09-cv-02955-EMC

24 Plaintiffs,

**[PROPOSED] STIPULATED
PERMANENT INJUNCTION**

25 v.

26 CITY OF OAKLAND, A PUBLIC ENTITY,
et al.,

27 Defendants.

INTRODUCTION

2 In accordance with the Court’s Order Granting Plaintiffs’ Motion for Voluntary
3 Dismissal dated November 15, 2012 (*See* Docket 531), Plaintiffs and Defendants jointly submit
4 this proposed Stipulated Permanent Injunction (“Injunction”). The parties have consented to
5 the entry of this Stipulated Permanent Injunction to resolve all matters of dispute between them
6 in the above-entitled actions. Pursuant to the Court’s November 15, 2012 Order, this proposed
7 Stipulated Permanent Injunction contains all of the terms of the agreed-upon permanent
8 injunction for this case.

Permanent Injunction

10 Plaintiffs and up to (4) four persons acting in concert, shall be permitted to unfettered
11 access without any ticket requirement the following areas in order to conduct their free speech
12 activity (i.e., videotaping, displaying signs, leafletting, or otherwise protesting):

13 (1) A three (3)-foot wide walkway running alongside the perimeter wall of the animal
14 compound. Defendants or Ringling Bros. may construct a fence to demark the three (3)-foot
15 wide walkway on side of walkway opposite the perimeter wall of the animal compound of the
16 Ringling Bros. Circus events, located on the North and East sides and West side to the frontage
17 road entrance gate, at the Oracle Arena in Oakland, California, to create a corridor.

23 (3) The upper west landing area, up to the point where the west ramp joins the landing.

24 (4) One specific spot located in the area adjacent to the entrance to the north tunnel,
25 which has a clear view of the entire tunnel. Here, only one person rather than four shall be
26 permitted access.

27 (5) The north ramp and landing.

28 (6) The northeast stairs and base of the stairs.

1 Furthermore, Plaintiffs and persons acting in concert with them should be permitted free
2 access to all exterior areas of the Arena and parking lot which are otherwise open to the public.

3 Defendants are required to distribute copies of the preliminary injunction to any security
4 manager, security guard, and/or police officer providing security at the Arena during the circus
5 engagement. Moreover, all security personnel should be briefed as to the material terms of the
6 injunction.

7 In addition, Defendants shall designate one “point person” during the entirety of the
8 circus engagement at the Arena, who shall be responsible for communicating with
9 Mr. Cuvielo and Ms. Bolbol in the event of a dispute and who has the power to make immediate
10 decisions in regard thereto.

11 The preliminary injunction need only apply to circus events scheduled at the
12 Coliseum/Arena, such as the Ringling Brothers Circus.

13 The Court shall retain jurisdiction over any disputes that arise with respect to these cases
14 and the permanent injunction is hereby entered.

15 **SO STIPULATED.**

16 Dated: November 26, 2012

GONZALEZ & LEIGH LLP

17
18 By: /s/ G. Whitney Leigh
19 G. WHITNEY LEIGH
20 Attorneys for Plaintiff
DENIZ BOLBOL

21 Dated: November 26, 2012

22 /s/ Joseph Cuvielo
23 JOSEPH CUVIELLO
24 Plaintiff In Pro Per

25
26
27
28

1 Dated: November 26, 2012

BRAGG & KULUVA

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

By: /s/ Stephen M. MacPhail

STEPHEN M. MACPHAIL

Attorneys for Defendants

SMG, COUNTY OF ALAMEDA, RON
LITTLE, LEROY "SKEET" ELLIS,
OAKLAND-ALAMEDA COUNTY
COLISEUM AUTHORITY and
OAKLAND COLISEUM JOINT
VENTURE

Dated: November 26, 2012

GRAY DUFFY, LLP

By: /s/ Richard M. Williams

RICHARD M. WILLIAMS

Attorneys for Defendants CITY OF
OAKLAND, OAKLAND POLICE
OFFICER R. VALLADON, OAKLAND
POLICE OFFICER R. VILLEGAS

Therefore, Plaintiffs' motion for voluntary dismissal of is hereby **GRANTED**.

Upon the filing of this document, the Clerk of the Court shall enter a final judgment and close
the file in this case.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: 11/27/12

